

## CONTENTS

FOREWORD

SUMMARY

RECOMMENDATIONS

CHAPTER ONE **Introduction**

CHAPTER TWO **The Conduct of Phase Two, Stage Four of the Inquiry**

Terms of Reference 75  
The Subject Matter 75  
The Approach of the Inquiry 75  
Evidence 76  
The Inquiry's Own Consultations 92  
Before the Oral Hearings 93  
The Oral Hearings 94  
The Seminars 95  
The Structure of This Report 95  
The Effect of the Evidence 96

CHAPTER THREE **The Appointment of General Practitioners and the Administration of General Practice prior to 1980: Shipman's Appointment to the Donneybrook Practice**

Introduction 99  
The Wider Professional Regulatory Framework 99  
Before 1974 100  
From 1974: the Structure and Functions of the Family Practitioner Committees 101  
The Regional Medical Service 105  
Shipman's Appointment to the Donneybrook Practice 105  
Conclusions 111

CHAPTER FOUR **The Monitoring of General Practitioners from 1980 to 1998: the Arrangements for Monitoring in Tameside**

Introduction 115  
From 1980 to 1990 115  
From 1990 to 1998 118  
The Arrangements in Tameside 124  
The Arrangements Elsewhere 138  
Conclusions 139

CHAPTER FIVE **Developments in the Arrangements for Monitoring General Practitioners since 1998**

Introduction	143
The Devolution of Power to the Primary Care Trusts	143
Quality	144
Changes in the Arrangements for General Practice	146
The Primary Care Trusts	146
The Ability of Primary Care Trusts to Manage Their Lists	149
Dealing with Poor Performance	160
Maintaining Quality	166
The 2004 General Medical Services Contract	173
Conclusions	176

CHAPTER SIX **Complaints and Discipline prior to April 1996**

Introduction	179
General Practitioners' Terms of Service	179
The Framework of the Complaints and Disciplinary System	180
Complaints Made against Shipman: 1985 to 1993	186
Recognition of the Need for Change	201

CHAPTER SEVEN **Complaints and Discipline after 1996**

Introduction	203
The 1996 Complaints Procedures	203
Reactions to the 1996 Complaints Procedures	208
The 1996 Disciplinary Procedures	211
Research into the Operation of the 1996 Complaints Procedures	214
Commitment to Reform: Consultation	217
Disciplinary Procedures after April 2004	226
Conclusions	227

CHAPTER EIGHT **Raising Concerns about Shipman**

Introduction	229
The Doctors at the Donneybrook Practice	229
The Concerns of Mrs Christine Simpson	232
The Concerns of Mr John Shaw	244
The Concerns of Mrs Dorothy Foley and Mrs Elizabeth Shawcross	246
The Concerns of Mrs Shirley Harrison	248
The Concerns of Mr David and Mrs Deborah Bambroffe	250
The Concerns of Dr Linda Reynolds	250
The Concerns of Bereaved Families and Friends	251
Conclusions	251

CHAPTER NINE	<b>Raising Concerns: the Role of the Practice Staff</b>
	Introduction 253
	The Staff of the Market Street Surgery 253
	Conclusions 274
	The Raising of Concerns by Practice Staff 278
	The Way Forward 283
CHAPTER TEN	<b>Raising Concerns: the Death of Mrs Renate Overton Revisited</b>
	Introduction 287
	Was There a Duty to Report? 288
	Evidence of How the Duty to Report Actually Operated in the NHS in 1994 295
	A Final Consideration of the Positions of Dr Brown and Dr Husaini 304
	Causation 307
CHAPTER ELEVEN	<b>Raising Concerns: the Way Forward</b>
	Introduction 317
	Public Concern at Work 320
	The Public Interest Disclosure Act 1998 322
	Raising Concerns in the Health Sector 329
	Improving the Position for the Future 339
	Concerns Felt by Others 347
	Conclusions 349
CHAPTER TWELVE	<b>Clinical Governance</b>
	Introduction 351
	Structures and Systems 352
	The Implementation of Clinical Governance by Primary Care Trusts 353
	Monitoring of Clinical Governance Arrangements 380
	Conclusions 383
CHAPTER THIRTEEN	<b>Single-Handed Practitioners</b>
	Introduction 387
	Definitions, Statistics and Trends 388
	Shipman 391
	Government Policy 393
	The Advantages and Disadvantages of Single-Handed Practice 394
	Mitigating the Problems of Single-Handed Practice 401
	Conclusions 403

CHAPTER FOURTEEN	<b>The Monitoring of Mortality Rates among the Patients of General Practitioners</b>
	Introduction 407
	The Analysis of Mortality Data before Shipman's Arrest 407
	The Analysis of Mortality Data after Shipman's Arrest 409
	The Inquiry's Approach 411
	The Work of Dr Paul Aylin and His Team 413
	The Possible Framework for a Monitoring System 422
	Recent Work on Analysing and Investigating Mortality Rates 425
	Future Investigations 429
	Potential Problems with Monitoring 431
	Other Possible Statistical Approaches 437
	The Concerns of the Profession 439
	The Potential Advantages of a Monitoring System 439
	Conclusions 442
CHAPTER FIFTEEN	<b>The General Medical Council</b>
	Introduction 445
	History 446
	Various Functions 449
	Present Structure 451
	The 'Old' Fitness to Practise Procedures in Outline 453
	Criticism of the General Medical Council and the Movement for Reform 457
	Recognition of the Need for Change 461
	Conclusions 464
CHAPTER SIXTEEN	<b>The General Medical Council's Handling of Shipman's Case in 1976</b>
	Introduction 467
	The General Medical Council's Procedures in 1976 468
	The Shipman Case 490
	Possible Criticisms of the General Medical Council's Handling of Shipman's Case 513
	Conclusions 520
CHAPTER SEVENTEEN	<b>Serious Professional Misconduct and Seriously Deficient Performance: Problems of Definition</b>
	Introduction 523
	Serious Professional Misconduct 523
	Seriously Deficient Performance 537
	Conclusions 540

CHAPTER EIGHTEEN    **The General Medical Council Conduct Procedures:  
Initial Stages Conducted by the Administrative Staff**

- Introduction    *543*
- Sources of Reports about Doctors    *544*
- The Initial Processing of Conduct Cases under the 'Old'  
Procedures    *546*
- The Procedure for Dealing with Convictions    *553*
- Audit    *554*
- Advice to Refer a Complaint to Local Complaints  
Procedures    *555*
- Investigating the Circumstances of a Complaint    *573*
- Communications with Doctors' Employers and Primary Care  
Organisations    *585*
- Some Problems with Cases Closed by General Medical Council  
Staff    *593*
- Ascertaining the Identity of a Doctor Who Is the Subject of a  
Complaint    *600*
- Conclusions    *606*

CHAPTER NINETEEN    **The General Medical Council's Conduct  
Procedures: Screening**

- Introduction    *609*
- The Role of the Screener from the 1970s until 1996    *610*
- Developments in the Screening Process from 1996 to 1997    *621*
- Developments in the Screening Process since 1998    *631*
- Some Problems with the Screening Process    *657*
- The Inquiry's Examination of Cases    *666*
- Conclusions    *680*

CHAPTER TWENTY **The General Medical Council Conduct Procedures:  
the Preliminary Proceedings Committee**

- Introduction 683
- The Composition of the Preliminary Proceedings Committee 684
- The Functions and Powers of the Preliminary Proceedings Committee 686
- The Possible Outcomes of the Consideration of a Case by the Preliminary Proceedings Committee 688
- The Approach Adopted by the Preliminary Proceedings Committee in Some Specific Types of Case 698
- The Workload of the Preliminary Proceedings Committee in the 1990s 701
- The 2000 Policy Studies Institute Report 701
- The Differing Roles of the Preliminary Proceedings Committee and the Screeners: the Case of Toth 711
- The Case of Richards 712
- The Workload of the Preliminary Proceedings Committee from 2000 to 2003 722
- Two More Cases of Judicial Review 723
- The Case of Holmes 724
- Later Developments 728
- The Cancellation by the Preliminary Proceedings Committee of Hearings before the Professional Conduct Committee 733
- The Inquiry's Examination of Cases 735
- Conclusions 744

CHAPTER TWENTY ONE **The General Medical Council Conduct Procedures:  
the Professional Conduct Committee**

- Introduction 749
- The Composition of the Professional Conduct Committee 749
- The Function and Powers of the Professional Conduct Committee 751
- The Procedure at a Hearing before the Professional Conduct Committee 751
- The Work of the Policy Studies Institute 784
- The Professional Conduct Committee Working Group 787
- Recent Developments 789
- Restoration to the Medical Register 792
- Appeals and Referrals 795
- Discussion 800

CHAPTER TWENTY TWO **The General Medical Council's Health Procedures**

Introduction 807  
Local Procedures for Dealing with Concerns about Doctors' Health 809  
Sources of Reports about a Doctor's Ill Health 810  
The Initial Process for Dealing with Reports about Health 811  
The Voluntary Health Procedures 823  
The Health Committee 834  
The Operation of the Health Procedures 840  
The Inquiry's Examination of Cases 842  
The Future of the Health Procedures 853  
Conclusions 854

CHAPTER TWENTY THREE **How the General Medical Council Deals with Cases of Drug Abuse**

Introduction 857  
Two Cases Considered by the Preliminary Proceedings Committee in November 2002 858  
The General Medical Council's Approach to Cases of Drug Abuse 866  
What Should the General Medical Council's Approach Be in Drug Abuse Cases? 872  
Conclusions 873

CHAPTER TWENTY FOUR **The General Medical Council's Performance Procedures**

Introduction 875  
The Legislative Framework 879  
The Process for Dealing with Complaints about Performance 880  
The Operation of the Performance Procedures 904  
Judicial Decisions on the Performance Procedures 908  
The Inquiry's Examination of Cases 916  
The Performance Procedures Review Group 926  
The Future 930

CHAPTER TWENTY FIVE **The General Medical Council's New Fitness to Practise Procedures**

Introduction 935  
Preparations for Change 936  
The Operation of the New Procedures: a Summary 939  
The Separation of Functions within the Fitness to Practise Procedures 940  
The Tests to Be Applied 945  
The Roles of the Investigation Committee and of the Case Examiners 954  
The Investigation Stage 964  
Interim Orders 1001  
The Adjudication Stage 1002  
Conclusions 1023

CHAPTER TWENTY SIX **Revalidation**

Introduction 1027  
The Development of the General Medical Council's Proposals for Revalidation up to the End of 2002 1028  
A Change of Direction 1044  
The Revalidation Proposals at the Time of the Inquiry Hearings 1063  
Developments since Early 2004 1077  
An Important Concern 1083  
Whither Revalidation? 1086  
Could Revalidation Catch 'Another Shipman'? 1089  
Conclusions 1090

CHAPTER TWENTY SEVEN **Proposals for Change**

Introduction 1093  
Proposals for Change Affecting NHS Arrangements for Primary Care 1094  
The Availability of Information about Doctors 1133  
Proposals for Change Affecting the General Medical Council 1146  
Conclusions 1177

APPENDIX A **Participants in Phase Two, Stage Four of the Inquiry and Their Representatives**

APPENDIX B **Participants in the Inquiry Seminars: 19<sup>th</sup>–30<sup>th</sup> January 2004**

APPENDIX C **Respondents to the Inquiry's Stage Four Consultation Paper**

APPENDIX D **Appraisal Forms for General Practitioners Working in the NHS**

APPENDIX E **'Following Shipman: a pilot system for monitoring mortality rates in primary care'  
Reproduced with Permission from The Lancet**

APPENDIX F **Participants in the Inquiry Seminars: 13<sup>th</sup>–14<sup>th</sup> October 2003**

APPENDIX G **'Good Medical Practice'  
A General Medical Council Booklet**